

The first problem on the sixth homework assignment asked you to find an example of a sequence  $\{a_n\}$  of complex numbers such that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} a_n$  converges (conditionally), yet the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} a_n^3$  diverges. Here are some remarks about this problem.

First of all, there is no hope of finding an example in which  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} a_n$  is absolutely convergent. Indeed, the terms of a convergent series must tend to 0, so when  $n$  is sufficiently large, it will be the case that  $|a_n| \leq 1$ , whence  $|a_n^3| \leq |a_n|$ . Therefore the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} a_n^3$  will be absolutely convergent if  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} a_n$  is.

Consequently, one has to seek for the required example among the conditionally convergent series. The most popular example is to set  $a_n$  equal to  $\frac{\exp(2\pi i n/3)}{n^{1/3}}$ . Then  $a_n^3 = 1/n$ , so the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} a_n^3$  is the divergent harmonic series. What remains to check is that the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} a_n$  does converge.

**Method 1** In your first calculus class, you probably learned a convergence test for alternating series stating that if  $\{b_n\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  is a sequence of positive real numbers monotonically decreasing to 0, then the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n b_n$  converges. But this test does not fit the situation at hand.

You may or may not have seen a generalization of the alternating-series test that does apply. Namely, Dirichlet's test says that if (as before)  $\{b_n\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  is a sequence of positive real numbers monotonically decreasing to 0, and if  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} c_n$  is a possibly divergent series of complex numbers having bounded partial sums (that is,  $|\sum_{n=1}^k c_n|$  stays bounded independently of  $k$ ), then the series  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} c_n b_n$  converges. (In the alternating-series test,  $c_n = (-1)^n$ , so  $|\sum_{n=1}^k c_n|$  is either 0 or 1, hence bounded independently of  $k$ .) Dirichlet's test is present—but not prominent—in the textbook: see Problem 8(a) on page 18 in Chapter 2. (The authors do not name the test.)

To apply the test to solve your problem, set  $b_n$  equal to  $1/n^{1/3}$  and  $c_n$  equal to  $\exp(2\pi i n/3)$ . Since

$$\exp(2\pi i/3) + \exp(4\pi i/3) + \exp(6\pi i/3) = 0, \quad (1)$$

it follows that each partial sum  $\sum_{n=1}^k c_n$  is either  $\exp(2\pi i/3)$  or  $\exp(2\pi i/3) + \exp(4\pi i/3)$  (which simplifies to  $-1$ ) or 0. Thus these partial sums all have modulus bounded by 1, and

Dirichlet's test implies that  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\exp(2\pi i n/3)}{n^{1/3}}$  does converge.

(The proof of Dirichlet's test, incidentally, is based on Abel's technique of partial summation, analogous to integration by parts.)

**Method 2** It is possible to verify the convergence by concrete estimation of groups of terms, as follows. The mean-value theorem from real calculus, applied to the function  $1/x^{1/3}$ , implies that

$$\left| \frac{1}{(n+1)^{1/3}} - \frac{1}{n^{1/3}} \right| \leq \frac{1}{3} \cdot \frac{1}{n^{4/3}} \quad \text{and} \quad \left| \frac{1}{(n+2)^{1/3}} - \frac{1}{n^{1/3}} \right| \leq \frac{2}{3} \cdot \frac{1}{n^{4/3}}. \quad (2)$$

(What is being used here is that the change in a real-valued function on an interval is at most the width of the interval times the maximal value of the absolute value of the derivative. The

derivative of  $1/x^{1/3}$  is  $-(1/3)/x^{4/3}$ , and the absolute value of this derivative takes its biggest value on the interval  $[n, n + 2]$  at the left-hand endpoint.)

In view of equation (1), the expression

$$\left| \frac{\exp(2\pi i n/3)}{n^{1/3}} + \frac{\exp(2\pi i(n+1)/3)}{(n+1)^{1/3}} + \frac{\exp(2\pi i(n+2)/3)}{(n+2)^{1/3}} \right|$$

can be rewritten, by adding and subtracting

$$\frac{\exp(2\pi i(n+1)/3)}{n^{1/3}} + \frac{\exp(2\pi i(n+2)/3)}{n^{1/3}},$$

as

$$\left| \left( \frac{1}{(n+1)^{1/3}} - \frac{1}{n^{1/3}} \right) \exp(2\pi i(n+1)/3) + \left( \frac{1}{(n+2)^{1/3}} - \frac{1}{n^{1/3}} \right) \exp(2\pi i(n+2)/3) \right|.$$

By the triangle inequality and property (2), this expression is bounded above by  $1/n^{4/3}$ .

To demonstrate convergence of  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\exp(2\pi i n/3)}{n^{1/3}}$ , it suffices to show that expressions of the form

$$\left| \sum_{n=j}^k \frac{\exp(2\pi i n/3)}{n^{1/3}} \right| \tag{3}$$

get arbitrarily close to 0 when  $j$  and  $k$  get large. If necessary, add one or two terms to the end of the sum to guarantee that the number of terms is a multiple of 3; the error thereby introduced has modulus less than  $2/k^{1/3}$ . The estimate on groups of three terms derived above shows that

$$\left| \sum_{n=j}^k \frac{\exp(2\pi i n/3)}{n^{1/3}} \right| < \frac{2}{k^{1/3}} + \sum_{n=j}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n^{4/3}}. \tag{4}$$

Since  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} 1/n^{4/3}$  is a convergent series, both terms on the right-hand side of (4) do indeed get close to 0 when  $j$  and  $k$  get large. That deduction completes the argument.